

# Contract for a completed piece of work

## 1. Consensual contract

- Where a party agrees to pay for a completed piece of work which is to be carried out by the other party (contractor).
- 94Da42976: If the contractor's own material is to be used and the completed item is 'generic' (not specifically catered for the principal), it is a contract of sale. If the completed item is specifically for the principal, then it is a contract for a completed piece of work. Contract to manufacture and supply waste water treatment facility (including evaporation tubes)
- 88Daka31866: Contract for the supply of axle housings which were to be manufactured with contractor's own material (steel shaft). Owner inspected but was unable to discover the defect. Owner sold it to a buyer, who discovered the defect and terminated the sale with a claim for damages. Owner now sues the contractor.
  - Art 667 applies. Art 580(1) does not apply (irrelevant whether the plaintiff should, or could not, have known the defect.
  - Owner has the 'right', not a 'duty' to inspect. Owner has the power to reject the work if the parties agreed that "the inspection of the owner is final."
  - But contributory negligence of the owner may be taken into account.
  - 333, 334 335 336 337 338, 339 340 341 342 343 344 345 346 347 348 349 350 351 352 353 354 355 356 357 358 359 360 361 362 363 364 365 366 367 368 369 370 371 372 373 374 375 376 377 378 379 380 381 382 383 384 385 386 387 388 389 390 391 392 393 394 395 396 397 398 399 400 401 402 403 404 405 406 407 408 409 410 411 412 413 414 415 416 417 418 419 420 421 422 423 424 425 426 427 428 429 430 431 432 433 434 435 436 437 438 439 440 441 442 443 444 445 446 447 448 449 450 451 452 453 454 455 456 457 458 459 460 461 462 463 464 465 466 467 468 469 470 471 472 473 474 475 476 477 478 479 480 481 482 483 484 485 486 487 488 489 490 491 492 493 494 495 496 497 498 499 500 501 502 503 504 505 506 507 508 509 510 511 512 513 514 515 516 517 518 519 520 521 522 523 524 525 526 527 528 529 530 531 532 533 534 535 536 537 538 539 540 541 542 543 544 545 546 547 548 549 550 551 552 553 554 555 556 557 558 559 560 561 562 563 564 565 566 567 568 569 570 571 572 573 574 575 576 577 578 579 580 581 582 583 584 585 586 587 588 589 590 591 592 593 594 595 596 597 598 599 600 601 602 603 604 605 606 607 608 609 610 611 612 613 614 615 616 617 618 619 620 621 622 623 624 625 626 627 628 629 630 631 632 633 634 635 636 637 638 639 640 641 642 643 644 645 646 647 648 649 650 651 652 653 654 655 656 657 658 659 660 661 662 663 664 665 666 667 668 669 670 671 672 673 674 675 676 677 678 679 680 681 682 683 684 685 686 687 688 689 690 691 692 693 694 695 696 697 698 699 700 701 702 703 704 705 706 707 708 709 710 711 712 713 714 715 716 717 718 719 720 721 722 723 724 725 726 727 728 729 730 731 732 733 734 735 736 737 738 739 740 741 742 743 744 745 746 747 748 749 750 751 752 753 754 755 756 757 758 759 760 761 762 763 764 765 766 767 768 769 770 771 772 773 774 775 776 777 778 779 780 781 782 783 784 785 786 787 788 789 790 791 792 793 794 795 796 797 798 799 800 801 802 803 804 805 806 807 808 809 810 811 812 813 814 815 816 817 818 819 820 821 822 823 824 825 826 827 828 829 830 831 832 833 834 835 836 837 838 839 840 841 842 843 844 845 846 847 848 849 850 851 852 853 854 855 856 857 858 859 860 861 862 863 864 865 866 867 868 869 870 871 872 873 874 875 876 877 878 879 880 881 882 883 884 885 886 887 888 889 890 891 892 893 894 895 896 897 898 899 900 901 902 903 904 905 906 907 908 909 910 911 912 913 914 915 916 917 918 919 920 921 922 923 924 925 926 927 928 929 930 931 932 933 934 935 936 937 938 939 940 941 942 943 944 945 946 947 948 949 950 951 952 953 954 955 956 957 958 959 960 961 962 963 964 965 966 967 968 969 970 971 972 973 974 975 976 977 978 979 980 981 982 983 984 985 986 987 988 989 990 991 992 993 994 995 996 997 998 999 1000

## 2. Sub-contracting: allowed in principle

- The manner of carrying out the work is for the contractor to decide. The owner, however, may give instructions – without impairing the contractor's independence.
- Unless otherwise agreed or the nature of the contracted work does not allow, contractor may sub-contract the work, for which the contractor remains responsible. Contractor shall be liable for sub-contractor's fault (Art. 391)
- 2001Da82545: Sub-contracting itself is not a breach.

### **3. Ownership of the completed piece of work**

- Where the principal (project owner) provided the material, the completed item belongs to the principal. If, however, the value added by the contractor is "manifestly greater" than the cost of materials, then the contractor acquires the ownership (but has the contractual duty to hand over the completed item to the principal). Art. 259.
- 98Du16675: Building contractor who used his materials will acquire the ownership of the completed building – unless otherwise agreed between the parties.
- 97Da8601: Where the planning permission was prepared in the principal's name and it is agreed that the completed building was to be registered under the principal's name, then the ownership of the completed building vests with the principal even if the contractor used his own building materials. The case, however, dealt with a situation where the contractor purchased the land from the land owners. The building permission was submitted in the name of the land owners and it was also agreed that the completed building would be registered under the land owners' name. But the Court interpreted that these arrangements were merely to "secure the payment of land purchase price". The registration, therefore,

conveys the title of the building only to the extent necessary to secure the payment of land price. The contractor acquires the ownership of the building. As soon as the land price is paid, the contractor fully recovers the ownership.

#### **4. Contractor's warranty liability**

- Where the completed work (if the work is to be completed in stages, the completed stage) is defective, the principal may demand repair, and additionally, seek compensation for loss caused by the defect. Art. 667
- If the defect is not material AND if the cost for repair is excessive, damages only may be sought. Contractor shall not be compelled to repair in such a case (to avoid economic waste).
- Defence of simultaneous performance. Art. 667(3). In principle, the owner may withhold the entirety of payment until the defect is repaired or damage is paid. But 91Da33056 reduces the scope of defence so that the owner may withhold only the "portion" of the payment corresponding to the defect. 2001Da9304 provides a more detailed guidance for this rule: When the repair cost (or damage in lieu of repair) is relatively small compared to the owner's unpaid payment and when it is doubtful whether the owner would willingly pay even if the defect is repaired, then the contractor shall be entitled to receive the payment due minus the repair cost; the owner may not refuse payment of the entire amount due (even if the repair has not been done).
- 2001Da9304: Where payment was to be made in stages of completion, the principal may withhold payment regardless of whether the defect was in the stage of work corresponding to the payment obligation. Defect in a previous stage of work which was discovered after the payment for that stage was fully made, can be a ground

to withhold payment for the current stage of work.

- Measure of damage: (Where repair may not be compelled) the difference between the market value of the completed (stage of) work without the defect and the market value of the present work with defect. The pain and suffering caused by the defective work is special damage (contractor's foreseeability must be proven). 96Da45436
- 95Da30345: Where the repair may be compelled, the principal may elect to seek compensation instead of the repair. The actual cost of repair may be claimed. If there is other loss, that may also be claimed.
- Where the principal elects to seek compensation, can the contractor "insist" upon repair? Probably not. The contractor can limit the amount of damage award to the actual cost of repair.
- Termination: if the defect of the completed (stage of) work defeats the purpose of the contract, the principal may terminate the contract. Art. 668.
- 93Da25080: If the completed stage of work is beneficial to the principal and if it is wasteful to order restoration of the completed stage of work, the termination may not have retroactive effect. the principal must make payment *pro rata* (contract price x percentage of completion calculated in terms of the cost of carrying out the work). Also see 2000Da40995
- Where buildings and installations are "completed", the principal may not terminate the contract even if the defect is serious enough to defeat the purpose of the contract. Art. 668. While the buildings or installations are not yet completed, the termination shall be governed by the general principle of 'materiality' of the breach. Still, however, the completed stage may not be affected by the termination. 94Da18584 and 93Da25080
- Limitation period:
  - Ground work and installations: 5 years
  - Stone, Concrete, Brick, metal or other durable structures: 10 years

- Other works: 1 year.
  - Limitation period begins to run from the date of actual delivery or completion of work (where delivery is not necessary).
  - If the completed work is destroyed or damaged, claims must be brought within 1 year. (Art 671(2))
  - Any manner of 'demand' (including extra-judicial demand) is sufficient.
- Exclusion of warranty or reduction of limitation period is possible. However, exclusion or shortening of limitation period is ineffective with regard to defect known to the contractor (and unknown to the principal).  
Art 672

## **5. Payment for the completed work**

- In cash or in kind. Payable upon completion of work and delivery, where delivery is necessary.
- Where an advance payment was agreed in order to enable the contractor to purchase materials and hire workmen, the amount shall be set off against the completed stage of work corresponding to the percentage of the given stage's progress. The principal may not set off the entirety of the advance against any given stage of work. 2001Da1386. If, for example, 30% of the contract price was paid upfront as an advance and a stage of work representing 10% of the entire work is completed, then the principal needs to pay 7% of the contract price and the remaining 3% of the contract price can be set off against the advance payment (10% of the advance payment may be set off).
- Contractor's lien to secure payment for the completed work. Art. 320. If, however, the building was built with contractors' own materials and if there was no agreement to make it a property of the principal, then on

completion of the building the contractor becomes its owner. The contractor cannot have a lien over his own property. 91Da14116

- Contractor may 'demand' the owner of the completed building to set up a hypothec to secure payment due to the contractor. The hypothec will arise only when it is registered (and the contractor may compel the owner to register the hypothec). Art. 666.

## **6. Principal's duty to cooperate**

- Depending on the nature of work, the principal may have a contractual duty to cooperate.
- 96Da14364: Where the principal's refusal made it impossible for the contractor to complete the work, the contractor is entitled to full payment of the contract price.
- Principal does not have a duty to inspect unless explicitly agreed otherwise. Even when the parties agree that the principal must inspect, this is often interpreted to empower the principal to reject the work upon inspection.

## **7. Risk**

- As long as it is commercial reasonable to complete the work, the contractor must complete it even if completion is disrupted for any reason. The parties usually provide express terms to cope with force majeure and adopt a sensible solution for the contractor.
- Where the completed stage of work is preserved and only the future work is affected by unavoidable circumstances, the contractor would be entitled to the corresponding portion of the contract price.
- When the completed (stage of) work is destroyed before the delivery, or contractor's notification of completion

of, the completed stage of work, contractor bears the risk (the principal is relieved of the obligation to pay the contract price)

- 91Da14116: Once the contractor informed the principal to accept the completed stage of work, subsequent demolition by a third party will not relieve the principal of the obligation to make the payment corresponding to the completed stage of work.
- When the work is completed and delivered, then the risk passes to the principal. When payment is made in respect of the completed stage of work, the risk also passes to the principal to that extent.

## **8. Principal's Termination at will (Art. 673)**

- Principal may, at any time before the completion of the contracted work, may terminate the contract.
- Contractor's loss must be compensated. Contractor, however, must take reasonable steps to mitigate the loss.
- 2000Da37296: Upon termination by the principal, the contractor is entitled to damages (actual costs spent so far + the profit it would have enjoyed had the work been completed). If the contractor could reasonably use the resources (which were freed by the termination) to alternative contracts, or could have sold the materials (no longer needed because of the termination), the profit he could have enjoyed must be deducted from the damages payable by the principal.
- Art 832 of Commercial Code (Termination of voyage charter)

## **9. Bankruptcy and termination at will**

- In the event of the owner's bankruptcy, the contractor or the owner may terminate the contract and seek payment

for work done. (Art 674) Neither of the parties may seek damage.

- Debtor rehabilitation and bankruptcy act, Arts. 119, 121 apply only when the contractor is bankrupt. (2001Da13624) If the contract was not completed, the trustee of the bankrupt estate of the contractor may choose whether to terminate or to continue with the contract. If the bankrupt estate of the contractor terminates the contract, the owner may claim damage.